

The Comparative Study Between Disney's Mulan and BTS Fanfiction Mugunghwa: A Flower in Moonlight's Path by Winter

Cynantia Rachmijati

IKIP Siliwangi, Indonesia

cynantia.rachmijati@gmail.com

Abstract

In the era of modern technology and popular culture, some fans appreciated literature by writing fanfiction. As stated by Lee (2011) it is called celebration of the media content. This aimed to describe the similarities and the dissimilarities between "Mulan" movie script and "Mugunghwa" fanfiction. The writer compared the elements by its intrinsic value based on Mufidah's (2011). In this research the writer used qualitative method and descriptive analysis. The aspects to be analyzed were intrinsic value in general manner of the theme, character, characterization, plot, setting, point of view and style. The similarities found were the plot, point of view and characters whereas the dissimilarities were the theme, the setting and also the writing style.

Keywords: comparative study literature, mulan, mugunghwa, fanfiction, BTS

Introduction

One of pop culture that exists and popular nowadays is K-Pop (Korean Pop). K-Pop is actually a genre of music in Korean entertainment industry that is performed by idol groups. The fans of K-Pop are commonly known as K-Popers –the abbreviation of K-Pop Lovers. Their interest in K-Pop encourages them to join various K-Pop communities that mostly use English to communicate. One of them is online *fanfiction* communities where they publish their self-written fiction about their favorite K-Pop group. ((Rosalina, Suhatmady, & Satyawati, 2016)

Fan fiction, as the name suggested, denotes texts written by fans about their favorite media and pop cultural icons. The members of fanfiction communities borrowed characters, settings, events, and/or concepts from existing TV shows, books, movies, bands, using these borrowing they crafted their original works of fiction by personalizing the source material based on their reader's knowledge of established characters and stories. Their fanfic production is ranging from threeline "drabble" (very short story, usually no more than a few paragraphs, and sometimes just a few lines.) to hundreds chaptered story with complex storyline and well-composed characterization (Black, 2005)

One of the most popular Kpop boyband known as BTS or *Bangtan Sonyeodan* has big fanbase and many fans, and some of those fans also write inspired-fanfiction based on popular literature. One of the fanfiction is entitled "Mugunghwa : a flower in moonlight path" is an omegaverse story where Jimin as an omega went to camp to undergo a military training specifically for Alpha and used special medicine to disguised as an Alpha to save his friend's family.

The omegaverse or alpha/beta/omega dynamics (often shortened to a/b/o) is an alternate universe consisting of a cluster of tropes involving humans with animalistic traits, inspired by the popular imagination of wolf biology and behavior, the rewriting of sex, gender, and the human reproductive system, and dynamics of dominance and submission. The majority of omegaverse stories focus on a romantic and/or sexual relationship between an alpha and an omega character. (Gunderson, 2017)

Susan Bassnett defines that comparative literature involves the study of text across cultures, interdisciplinary and that it is concerned with patterns of connection in literature and other studies across both time and space. She adds that the true task of comparative literature is to examine the phenomena of literature as a whole, to compare them, to group them, to enquire into the causes of them and to determine the results of them (Bassnett, 1993).

The story of Mulan which also well-known after Disney adopted it into the cinema begins with a young lady named Fa Mulan that sacrifices herself to save her beloved ones. Mulan is a young lady, not a feminine one, she has a trouble in finding a future husband because of it. Mulan pretends to act like a man, dressed like a man, and come to a real war as a soldier to save her father. She became a heroine not just for her father but also her kingdom.

This article analyzes the similarities and dissimilarities of “Mulan” and “Mugunghwa” using comparative literature to compare the intrinsic value in general manner of the theme, character, characterization, plot, setting, point of view and style.

Method

Research Design

This researcher uses qualitative research by descriptive analysis and library research.

Research Object

In this study, Disney’s “Mulan” (1996) movie script and Wiinter’s “Mugunghwa: a flower in moonlight path” (2019) fanfiction are the research object.

Source of Data

There are two kinds of sources data in this research:

- a. The main data are taken from the movie script and the fanfiction
- b. The supporting data are taken from books, articles, journals, article and others which have relationship with the main data.

Technique of Collecting Data

- a. First, close reading the fanfiction and the movie script
- b. Second, note taking whereas this activity will be done to write the data related with. This step is where the data will be sorted and filter
- c. Third, select notes to classify the data based on the formulation of statement problems stated in the statements of problems.
- d. Finally, interpret and discuss the data.

Technique of Analyzing Data

- a. This research combines the data from the movie and the fanfiction
- b. After it have been analyzed, then the data will be described
- c. The findings is described and analyzed deeply.

Result

In literary works, there is always a constructive elements (Na, 2013). There are the extrinsic elements and the intrinsic elements. Both of the elements are often mention by the critic in examine and or talking novel or another literary works . Both of the elements are very important in a literary works, especially the intrinsic elements. (Susanto, 2019) stated that "Intrinsic elements (intrinsic) are elements that build literary work itself. This elements what causes the present literary works as works of literatures"

After analyzing the data and classifying on the kinds of the intrinsic elements and moral values, the researcher intends to discuss the findings that have been investigated in this section to answer the research question. Based on the research finding, it is clear that for "Mulan" and "Mugunghwa" has similarities and differences. The similarities is obvious through "Mugunghwa" as it is a fanfiction inspired by "Mulan" story itself whereas the differences are lies in the writing style, the theme and the fanfiction element which is the above content.

Discussion

Intrinsic value will be discussed according to Mufidah (Mufidah, 2011) are : theme, character, characterization, plot, setting, point of view and style.

"Mulan" is 1998 American animated movies produced by Walt Disney and based on Chinese legend Hua Mulan. It was directed by Tony Bancroft and the movie script was written since 1996 by Rita Hsiao (Hsiao, 1996). "Mugunghwa : a flower in moonlight's path" is an archive of our own / a03 story written by Wiinter which could be find in <https://archiveofourown.org/works/17655086/chapters/41635973> (Wiinter, 2019)

This chapter will analyzes the similarities and dissimilarities of "Mulan" and "Mugunghwa" using comparative literature to compare the intrinsic value in general manner of the theme, character, characterization, plot, setting, point of view and writing style.

Theme

"Mulan" literary theme is about when you believe in anything you can reach whatever you want.

Textual evidence : *"Mulan stands at the gate to see her father, sitting under a cherry blossom tree. A slight breeze blows a blossom into Fa Zhou's lap. He looks at it tenderly as Mulan approaches, carrying Shan-Yu's sword. Fa Zhou looks up and sees her. Before he can rise, Mulan kneel before him. She presents the sword to him and bows. Mulan said, "I brought you the sword of Shan-Yu, and the crest of the emperor. They're gifts to honor the Fa family".*

"Mugunghwa" literary theme is about love and kindness conquers all.

Textual evidence : *"You're my best friend, Seokjin. You've saved my ass plenty of times in school as well. I know you'd do this for me should the situation be reversed."*

Character

The character in "Mulan" :

Name of the character	Textual evidence
Mulan	<i>"Mulan looks up at him, at his father. She wants to please him"</i>
Li-Shang	<i>"Shang gives her a harsh glance"</i>
Mu-Shu	<i>"Mu-shu mimes her gaze after Shang, you like him don't you he asked"</i>
Shan-Yu	<i>"The huns chuckles and Shan-Yu moves forward to fix the scarf"</i>
Chi Fu	<i>"As Chi Fu exits with a bath brush, towel and soap"</i>
Ling	<i>"Ling see some girls working in a field"</i>

The character in "Mugunghwa"

Name of the character	Textual evidence
Jimin	<i>"Jimin watches as Jin wipes his watery eyes"</i>
Jungkook	<i>"Jungkook has never seen a pretty alpha. Until now. And that oddly irritates him. What in the world"</i>
Taehyung	<i>"Taehyung comes in after him and throw himself into the bottom bunk of the opposite wall"</i>
Namjoon	<i>"Namjoon follows but at least he has the decency to keep his white shorts on"</i>
Seokjin	<i>"Seokjin smiles tremulously through another wave of tears"</i>

Characterization

The characterization in "Mulan":

Name of the character	Textual evidence	Characterization
Mulan	<i>"Mulan looks up at him, at his father. She wants to please him"</i> <i>"Mulan removes her father's sword from it's sheath and stretches out her long hair, she pause for a moment and then slash ! She cuts her hair"</i>	-Mulan is caring -Mulan is brave
Li-Shang	<i>"You will assemble swiftly and silently every morning, anyone who acts otherwise will answer to me"</i> <i>"He takes off his shirt, he's hot. Mulan takes a peak"</i>	-Li-Shang is very discipline -Li-Shang is attractive
Mu-Shu	<i>"My little baby...off to destroy people"</i> <i>"Now how am I gonna make Mulan a hero if she doesn't fight?"</i>	-Mu-shu is funny -Mu-Shu is attentive
Shan-Yu	<i>"Wouldn't your superiors be proud and the emperor will stop you"</i>	-Shan -Yu is proud and obnoxious
Chi Fu	<i>"Chi-Fu squeals like a girl"</i>	-Chi Fu is feminine character
Ling	<i>"I know we were jerks to you before but let us start over"</i>	-Ling is friendly

The characterization in "Mugunghwa"

Name of the character	Textual evidence	Characterization
Jimin	<p><i>"You're my best friend, Seokjin. You've saved my ass plenty of times in school as well. I know you'd do this for me should the situation be reversed."</i></p> <p><i>"But you know...I think you're amazing, Jimin. Though you're small and soft all over, your heart is full and courageous, like a flower that perseveres, even in the most volatile of tempests. I don't know anyone who'd go this far to help out a friend in need. Dangerous and foolish, yes, but also quite commendable."</i></p>	<p>-Jimin is caring</p> <p>-Jimin is brave</p>
Jungkook	<p><i>"Out of the three, Jimin likes Taehyung the most, then Joon. Jungkook and his aloof and unfriendly ass is not even included"</i></p> <p><i>"They're all strong and buff, emanating alpha appeal and alpha stench. His gaze stops on the one with a black bandanna around his head, broad shoulders, tall height, jet black hair, dark as night eyes. Jimin silently clicks his tongue. He'd be a handsome alpha if he learned to smile, Jimin thinks"</i></p> <p><i>"Jimin, you remind me of a quote my omma has told me before: A flower does not think of competing with the flower growing next to it. It just simply blooms. Think of us all as flowers, if you'd like. We all get watered the same and planted the same way, but sometimes we all bloom differently, perhaps even in different colors. What matters is not any of that, just the fact that we are. Don't waste time comparing yourself to others. You are your own person for a reason."</i></p>	<p>-Jungkook is cool and aloof</p> <p>-Jungkook is attractive</p> <p>-Jungkook is wise</p>
Taehyung	<p><i>"Okay. That was not his imagination. And the way Jimin's ears just pinkened...by god, he's willing to bet all his daisies that they have a secret between them. And they're not telling him. The audacity! Now, he just has to watch and figure out what it is before he pounces on them."</i></p> <p><i>"It's pretty, isn't it?" He hears the whisper and nods, smiling before looking upwards into the other smiling face. It's a pretty, friendly face, a boxy smile with charming eyes and long white hair to his shoulders. He's also tall and broad, but rather than intimidating, he gives off a happy vibe. Jimin decides to like him right off</i></p>	<p>-Taehyung is observant</p> <p>-Taehyung is quirky</p>
Namjoon	<p><i>"I'm not sure how to approach this subject but Jimin has become a friend. I'm rather fond of him, as is Tae. If you're not serious, please don't hurt him. He's sweet and delicate and deserves a mate who'd-"</i></p> <p><i>"Glancing over, he sees that it is Joon, reading by candlelight once again. Jimin had woken up once before from a dream to see him in the corner reading but he'd been too tired to inquire. Now, he looks closely and catches the title of the book, eyes widening in surprise. "You like poetry?""</i></p>	<p>-Namjoon is kind</p> <p>-Namjoon is studious</p>

Name of the character	Textual evidence	Characterization
Seokjin	<p><i>"I went to see the witch healer, Min Yoongi, and paid him to make me a potion." Seokjin holds up the vial. "I just need to sprinkle it into my tea and drink it. The spell will mask my omega scent and emanate a strong masculine one in its stead. It will keep the alphas from really guessing what I really am"</i></p> <p><i>"You have a right to be mad, but no right to call my friend names. I came out here of my own volition to explain a bit about Jimin, but maybe I'll keep that to myself after all. Jimin deserves someone better than a brute like you." Seokjin turns around to leave.</i></p>	<p>-Seokjin is determined</p> <p>-Seokjin is fierce</p>

Plot

Plot, there are five indicates that included as a plot they are exposition, rising action, climax, conflict, and resolution.

"Mulan" moviescript written by Rita Hsiao in 1996 were telling about a girl named Fa Mulan who were tomboyish and finding it hard to get a husband. When the war broke , she acted as her father's soldier because her father was old and sickly. Mulan then joined the guards where she met the leader named Li-Shang. Mulan were being helped by a great stone ancestor dragon named Mushu in order to keep her appearance in secret as she was disguising as a man. Mulan introduced herself as "Ping" to her fellow troops. As story progressed, Mulan befriended fellow soldiers from the troop named Yao,Ling and Chien-Po. The story continued where they tried to fight a villain named Shan-Yu the leader of the Hun Army who were against the emperor. The story ended with Mulan won the war againts Shan-Yu, recognized by the emperor and finally falling in love with Li-Shang, the leader of the troop.

Whereas "Mugunghwa : A flower in moonlight's path" written by Wiinter in 2019 were telling about an omega named Jimin who tried to save his brother Seokjin from going to an alpha training camp as the duty for the oldest child. Jimin drank a potion where he could mask his omega scent into an alpha scent. The training camp led by a cold hearted alpha named Jungkook. In the camp, Jimin the omega befriended Taehyung and Namjoon. As an omega, Jimin was obviously weaker than the alphas therefore he kept lagging behind in the training session and irritate Jungkook. One night after a midnight bath, Namjoon found out that Jimin was actually an omega and helped him ever since. The story continued with Jimin finally finishing the duty training camp and headed home. After Jungkook found out Jimin's secret, he tried to went to his house and the story ended with Jimin and Jungkook tied the knot.

From the synopsis it can be seen that both "Mulan" and "Mugunghwa" has similar plot from the exposition where the moment the main character is going to the war / to the camp and ended in the resolution where the main characters find love.

Setting

In “Mulan” the setting took place at :

Setting	Textual evidence
The Great wall	<i>A massive magnificent stone barriers snake along the mountain tops of China</i>
Fa family house	<i>Fa Zhou slowly rise s from the floor with the help of his cane. He turns to see his beloved tardy daughter</i>
The matchmaker room	<i>Mulan join a row of girls approaching the matchmaker room</i>
Army camping	<i>Mulan starts awkwardly walking through the camp observing the troops itching, scratching and picking various body parts</i>

Whereas in “Mugunghwa” the setting took place at :

Setting	Textual evidence
Seokjin's home	<i>“A soft knock resounds on the wood door to their room before it slides open. Jin nudges the teapot over to cover the small vial on the table as a servant bows to them before announcing that Seokjin's mother is calling for him. Jin nods back in acknowledgement.”</i>
Alpha's camp	<i>“Head to your cabins and settle in. The riverbed to bathe in is to the south, quarter mile walk. Get familiar with your surroundings, training starts tomorrow 5 am. Good evening, boys.” Lt. Dongwan turns around and leaves the grounds.”</i>
Jungkook's parents house	<i>“Jimin tries not to tremble too harshly as he watches Jungkook walk away from him and enter the long hallway that would take him to his father's council chambers.”</i>

Point of View

In “Mulan”, the third point of view used as first point of view as follow “*Mulan approach a soldier displaying a dragon tattoo*” and also second point of view were used as follow “*He punches him in the chest*”. Whereas in “Mugunghwa” , the point of view used as third point of view, as follow “*Jimin drops his little knapsack onto the small bench in the spotless courtyard and stares off into the bright, colorful garden beyond the koi pond*” but also first point of view were used also as follow “*Because no alpha is that soft-hearted. Not even Taehyung. I'm not even kidding. I'd never been so confused in my entire lifetime. Good to know my instincts were right.*”.

Style

The writing style for “Mulan” is formal, straight forward, simple and use less slang. For example “*Mulan tentatively slaps Yao behind in which Yao freeze*”. The writing style for “Mugunghwa” is less formal , more related to daily life such as “*when it comes to food, we kind of have this unspoken rule of whoever finishes first gets second dibs...but you don't do that*” and also “*You're my best friend, Seokjin. You've saved my ass plenty of times in school as well. I know you'd do this for me should the situation be reversed.*” In “Mulan” the idioms were used were formal and straight to the point whereas in “Mugunghwa” there were newer idioms and slang such as “*dibs*” and “*saved my ass*”.

Similarities and dissimilarities

To answer the research question of the article which is the similarities and dissimilarities of “Mulan” and “Mugunghwa” using comparative literature to compare the intrinsic value in general manner of the theme, character, characterization, plot, setting, point of view and style.

It is found that the similarities between “Mulan” and “Mugunghwa” are :

1. The plot, starting from the main characters went to the camp and ended with the main character find love
2. The point of view, in both story the first and third point of view were used
3. The character and characterization of “Mulan” and “Mugunghwa”. Mulan and Jimin are both caring and brave, Jungkook and Li-Shang are both disciplined, Mu-Shu and Namjoon are both attentive, Ling and Seokjin are friendly while fierce and honest and Chi-Fu and Taehyung are both quirky and yet observant.

It is found that the dissimilarities between “Mulan” and “Mugunghwa” are :

1. The theme between both stories where “Mulan” theme was about the belief you can be anything you wish and in “Mugunghwa” the central theme is love and kindness conquers all.
2. The setting in both stories where “Mulan” took place in Fa family house, the matchmaker and ended up in camp. Whereas in “Mugunghwa” the setting took place in Seokjin’s house, the alpha camp and ended up in Jungkook’s house.
3. The writing style of the story, in “Mulan” the writing style is more formal whereas in “Mugunghwa” the writing is less formal.

Conclusion

Related to the research question presented earlier in the introduction and are analyzed in the discussion, it is found that there were some similarities and dissimilarities between Disney’s “Mulan” and BTS Fanfiction “Mugunghwa : a flower in moonlights’ path”. The similarities are the plot, point of view and characters. Whereas the dissimilarities are the theme, setting and the writing style of the story.

From educational point of view, writing fanfiction can be seen as one effort to appreciate literature. As stated by Lee (Lee, 2011) fanfiction could be a channel to resist, extend or alter media content offered by established media conglomerates on a much more interactive and personalized level. This meant when fanfiction writers found the content of what they watched, read, or listened to was interesting, they tend to borrow and extracted it into their story. And thus “Mulan” were appreciated through fanfiction writer who wrote “Mugunghwa” in the BTS k-pop group context.

Acknowledgment

The writer would like to acknowledge English Education Study Program at IKIP SILIWANGI Bandung for the support and encouragement and many fanfic writers and BTS for the inspiration for this research.

References

- Bassnett, S. (1993). *Comparative literatures : a critical introduction*. UK: Blackwell Publisher.
- Black, R. (2005). Access and affiliation : the literacy and composition practices of english language learners in an online fanfiction community. *Journal of adolescent and adult literacy*, 118-128.
- Gunderson, M. (2017). *What is an omega? Rewriting sex and gender in omegaverse fanfiction*. Norway: University of Oslo.
- Hsiao, R. (1996). *Internet Movie Script Database*. Retrieved from IMSDb:
<https://www.imsdb.com/scripts/Mulan.html>
- Lee, A. (2011). Time travelling with fanfic writers : understanding fan culture through repeated online interviews . *Journal of audience and reception studies no 8 Vol 2*, 246-269.
- Mufidah. (2011). *Unsur intrinsik ekstrinsik sastra*. Surabaya: UNAIR.
- Na, L. (2013). A comparative study between a tale of two cities and the great gatsby : the self sacrifice spirit in romanticism. *Theory and practice in language studies Vol 3 No 11*, 2067-2071.
- Rosalina, Suhatmady, B., & Satyawati, S. (2016). A study on Indonesian kpopers' literacy activities in online english fanfiction community. *Bastra Vol 3 No 1* , 71-82.
- Susanto. (2019). An analysis of the intrinsic elements of kungfu panda 3 movie. *Journey Vol 2 No 2*, 156-164.
- Wiinter. (2019). *Archive of our own*. Retrieved from Ao3:
https://archiveofourown.org/works/17655086/chapters/41635973?view_adult=true